

# FRIENDS OF BOGGART HOLE CLOUGH

*Protecting our natural heritage*

Friends of Boggart Hole Clough (FoBHC), replacing the name Boggart Hole Clough Community Action Trust (BHCCAT), was founded in 2000.

## Objection to proposed demolition of the Lodge Gatehouse of former Booth Hall Children's Hospital

FoBHC is concerned about the site of the former Booth Hall Children's Hospital because it is adjacent to the Clough, across Charlestown Road. The Clough was part of the Booth Hall estate before becoming a Municipal Park in 1894.

Objection submitted 5.5.2015 as email below to Head of Planning at Manchester City Council.



To Julie Roscoe, Head of Planning, Manchester City Council (MCC).

Dear Julie Roscoe,

### **Objection relating to planning application number 108160/FO/2015/N1: proposal to demolish the Lodge Gatehouse of former Booth Hall Children's Hospital, Charlestown Road, north Manchester.**

Thanks for your 15.4.2015 letter which was attached to email below of same date from MCC Planning department.

Please see series of over 20 emails below dated from 27.6.2013 to 28.10.2013. These emails from various people, which include mention of the petition signed by 148 people, objected to the proposed demolition of the Administration Building of the former Booth Hall Hospital. They are, for the most part, just as relevant to the proposed demolition of the Lodge Gatehouse & they should therefore be taken into consideration.

Some comments follow regarding items (**highlighted in red type**) quoted from the 'Planning Statement' for this proposal prepared by CBRE Ltd 'on behalf of Taylor Wimpey Manchester' dated February 2015, downloaded from MCC's website:

- A. **"The new dwellings proposed to be built .. will retain the character & appearance of the existing building"** (item 1.5). New-build copies of old buildings cannot be classed as heritage assets. Furthermore, the proposed new dwellings (from looking at the plans provided on MCC's website) do not in fact **"retain the character & appearance of the existing building"**. For example, the flat-roofed shelter supported by three pillars & a stone arch, which reveal the building's former function as the hospital's gatehouse, is missing from the plans, presumably ditched. This important original feature of the building can be clearly seen in the 2 photos attached which were taken 3.6.2013.

# FRIENDS OF BOGGART HOLE CLOUGH

## *Protecting our natural heritage*

- B. “The Core Strategy Vision states that by 2027 Manchester will be a city with neighbourhoods where people choose to live all their lives because they offer a wide range of quality housing & an attractive environment where locally distinctive character is conserved & enhanced” (item 6.7). When “the hospital has been entirely cleared aside from the lodge building” (item 4.3) which the application now proposes to demolish as well, it is illogical nonsense to claim that the result will be an “environment where locally distinctive character is conserved & enhanced”.
- C. “Planning principles which should underpin both plan-making & decision-taking, set out at paragraph 17 of the NPPF [National Planning Policy Framework], state that planning should .. Conserve heritage assets in a manner appropriate to their significance” (item 6.20). Whilst the Lodge Gatehouse is not listed as of national heritage value by English Heritage, it is however of local heritage value for the neighbourhood of Charlestown which now has no other built heritage assets. The fewer buildings of heritage value in an area the more important they become for that area; if there is only one such building left, as in this case, then its heritage value becomes extremely significant for that local area. It surely deserves to be ‘locally listed’ by MCC as a non-designated heritage asset.
- D. “It is .. proper to seek to promote or reinforce local distinctiveness – [NPPF] paragraph 60 .. In weighing applications that affect directly or indirectly non-designated heritage assets, a balanced judgement will be required having regard to the scale of any harm or loss & the significance of the heritage asset – [NPPF] paragraph 135” (item 6.21). The “scale of .. loss” is nearly total as “the hospital has been entirely cleared aside from the lodge building” (item 4.3), so “the significance of the heritage asset” – the one remaining original building – is consequently increased. As already suggested, the Lodge Gatehouse should be listed & protected by MCC as a non-designated heritage asset.
- E. “Character & Context: A place with its own identity: design should be informed by location .. areas of change should promote a sense of place ..” (item 6.25). The proposal actually reverses this planning policy stipulation - the “location” to be completely flattened without even one original building left standing, the “sense of place” eliminated, its “identity” nullified, its “Character & Context” lost forever.
- F. The quotes above are among items from the ‘Planning Statement’ which supposedly prove that “the proposal .. fully accords with the statutory Development Plan for the area & the NPPF [National Planning Policy Framework]” (item 1.7). But, as shown, this can only be considered true if these planning policy stipulations are meaningless in practice, not worth the paper they’re written on.

As noted above, the ‘Planning Statement’ was prepared ‘on behalf of Taylor Wimpey Manchester’ (title page). It serves the interests of the corporate house-builder - greater profits can be made building on completely cleared sites. This is the underlying but undeclared motive for the proposed demolition.

There is no justification for erasing the last visible trace of the highly regarded former Booth Hall Children’s Hospital. Demolishing the Lodge Gatehouse would be a needless infliction on the local community demonstrating MCC’s disdain for the citizens it purports to represent.

Yours sincerely,  
Peter F. Milner.

P.F.M., Acting Secretary, FoBHC / BHCCAT .. Copied to some people interested in Boggart Hole Clough environs including FoBHC / BHCCAT members.

[Email copied to 87 FoBHC / BHCCAT contacts including local MP & Councillors. Email posted 6.5.2015 on Facebook – facebook.com/boggart.org.uk].